

# Bibliometric Analysis for Research Trends Nanofiltration Membranes in The Past Decade to 2023

Yurin Karunia Apsha Albaina Iasya<sup>a</sup>, Asep Bayu Dani Nandiyanto<sup>a</sup>

<sup>a</sup> Departemen Pendidikan Kimia, Fakultas Pendidikan Matematika dan Ilmu Pengetahuan Alam, Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia, Jl. Dr. Setiabudi no 229, Kota Bandung, 40154, Indonesia

\* Corresponding author: yurinkarunia@upi.edu

Received 11 June 2023 Accepted 10 January 2024 Published 15 January 2024

DOI: 10.51264/inajl.v4i1.40

#### Abstract

Water treatment is an important part that has an impact on life, to understand the progress of nanofiltration membrane research literature related to this field was obtained from the Google Scholar database. Based on mapping and visualization software VOSviewer, the number of publications and groupings were calculated and analyzed. Research advances and trends in the field of nanofiltration membranes are summarized. The results of the study show that since 2013 the quantity of publications in this field has increased every year until 2020 then decreased in 2021 and then increased again in 2022. This field has received attention including its wide application in water treatment. Related studies have been published in the journal of Membrane Science and Desalination which is the authoritative journal in this field with the largest number of publications. According to the keyword network map of nanofiltration membranes there are 8 clusters, and this field can generally be divided into three research stages, namely synthesis, characterization, and performance testing. To achieve the goals of research development, it must be further deepened in future work. This article will provide a reference for researchers engaged in membrane technology and its applications.

Keywords: Bibliometric, Computational mapping analysis, Nanofiltration membrane, Vosviewer.

### **1. Introduction**

Water treatment technology using membranes has been widely used because the separation process can be carried out continuously, it is easy to use, and there are no added chemicals so it is non-destructive and environmentally friendly (Kusworo *et al.*, 2021). Nanofiltration membrane (NF) is considered as a promising technology in water treatment because it has more advantages such as effective separation with a pore size of 0.001µm compared to other technologies (Behdarvand *et al.*, 2021a). Because of this, the application of nanofiltration membranes is used in separating contaminants in water and as a pre-treatment in water desalination (Ihsanullah, 2019; Thakur & Voicu, 2016).

During the last five decades the study of membranes as a water treatment technology has intensified. Due to the increasing concern about water pollution and the increasingly limited availability of clean water, it has attracted a lot of attention in recent years. A continuous and fast increase in the number of publications can be observed, especially since 2010 more than 5,000 Journals on membrane technology have been published, indicating that this technology is a growing research area in water treatment. Most studies in this field have been carried out, several authors have studied and analyzed the process of synthesis (Behdarvand *et al.*, 2021b; Park *et al.*, 2020), modification (Bet-Moushoul *et al.*, 2016; Karimi *et al.*, 2019), and the performance of antifouling NF membranes (Yuan *et al.*, 2014), antimicrobial (Wang *et al.*, 2018) and separation of contaminants in water (Bagheripour *et al.*, 2019). There are many emerging researches on water

treatment using NF membranes. Therefore, it is very important to study the characteristics and research status of NF membranes through bibliometric analysis methods.

Bibliometric analysis can analyze the impact or value of research achievements that combine statistical and mathematical methods to map the state of a growing research field based on online databases (Google Scholar, Pub Med, and Web of Science) to determine new scientific research directions and themes. Ding & Zeng, (2022) used bibliometrics to analyze research on household wastewater treatment, Plaza-Garrido *et al.*, (2022) analyzed the prospects for challenges of membrane separation processes to remove viruses, Mao *et al.*, (2021) analyzed sewage treatment industry from 1998 to 2019.

The results of the bibliometric analysis mapping research can be visualized using VOSviewer software to provide an overview of data representation and mapping of the relationship to the keyword "membrane nanofiltration" which has been published in related fields. Thus this study aims to conduct a bibliometric review of the literature regarding the general perspective of synthesis, materials, and applications developed regarding NF membranes.

#### **METHODS**

In order to trace the development trend of nanofiltration membranes in the last few decades, a statistical and visual study on literature published in 2013-2023 based on bibliometrics was carried out in this article. The research process is shown in Figure 1. First, literature related to the keyword "membrane nanofiltration" was searched using the Publish or Perish software through the Google Scholar database. Second, all literature information is exported as a (ris) file. Then the text files are imported in the visualization software (VOSviewer) for bibliometric analysis. Data mapping consists of three types, namely network, density, and overlay visualization. In addition, we also filter terms that will be included in the VOSviewer network mapping visualization. Finally obtained the results of the analysis and conclusions. Research Al Husaeni & Nandiyanto (2021) provides detailed information on how to install and use the Publish or Perish and VOSviewer software. Research by Azizah *et al.*, (2021) also provides detailed information about how to search the article database on Google Scholar.



Figure 1. The Research Process

### 3. Results and Discussion

The bibliometric study described here examines the analytical development of nanofiltration membrane research. This bibliometric analysis seeks to analyze and find research results, interactions between science and technology, map fields of science, track or trace the development of new knowledge in certain fields, and serve as an indicator of the future in providing a more competitive advantage. In strategic planning. Here a bibliometric analysis of nanofiltration membrane studies is carried out for 10 periods from 2013 to 2023 (Figure 2).

#### 3.1 Development of publication in the field of nanofiltration membranes

The development of publications in the field of NF membranes indexed by Google Scholar has increased significantly for 8 periods from 2013 to 2020. However, there has been a significant decline in 2021 due to the COVID-19 pandemic which has limited the number of research

activities. Publications increased again in 2022 to 76 publications. Furthermore, the number of articles decreased in 2023 because the data for this study were collected in mid-2023 (Table 1).

In this research, there are 73649 total citations from all articles; 7364.90 number of citations per year; 73.80 the number of citations per article; 4.92 average authors per article; all articles have an h-index of 130 and a g-index of 195.

Year of Publication	Number of Publication	
2013	73	
2014	84	
2015	97	
2016	101	
2017	110	
2018	112	
2019	119	
2020	132	
2021	64	
2022	76	
2023	55	

Table 1. Development of Nanofiltration Membrane Research



Figure 2. Level of Development in Nanofiltration Membrane Research

### **3.2** Visualization of nanofiltration membrane topic area using VOSviewer

In this study, 5 minimum quantities and 276 maximum quantities were used. If there are terms that are considered irrelevant to the research topic, they can be omitted. Furthermore, the article data is computationally mapped. Network visualization (Figure 3) shows 8 clusters that correlate with the NF membrane topic and the relationship between one term and another. Each of these items has been divided into 8 clusters, namely:

(i) Cluster 1 is marked in red which contains 11 items, desalination, dye salt separation, heavy metal removal, high performance nanofiltration, hydrophilicity, nanoparticle, polyethersulfone, pure water flux, salt rejection, selectivity, and water permeability.

(ii) Cluster 2 marked in blue contains 8 items, carbon nanotubes, chitosan, composite nanofiltration, morphology, structure, synthesis, water purification, and water treatment.

(iii) Cluster 3 is marked with purple which contains 7 items, cellulose nanocrystal, chlorine resistance, graphene oxide, polyethyleneimine, vinyl alcohol, water desalination and water flux.

(iv) Cluster 4 marked with green contains 7 items, antifouling performance, membrane performance, MOF, PEG, polyamide, surface modification, and thin film nanocomposite membrane.

(v) Cluster 5 is marked with yellow which contains 6 items, dye removal, MWCO, pressure, textile wastewater, wastewater, and wastewater treatment.

(vi) Cluster 6 is marked with orange which contains 4 items, membrane pore size, polyamide membrane, pore size, and surface charge.

(vii) Cluster 7 is marked with teracota which contains 3 items, high rejection, permeability, and water softening.

(viii) Cluster 8 is marked with tosca which contains 2 items, membrane technology and polymeric nanofiltration membrane.



Figure 3. Network visualization of nanofiltration membrane keyword.

The overlay visualization explains the historical traces of the research with the years studied. Figure 4a shows a visualization of the NF membrane overlay, it can be seen that the keyword membrane technology appears in a green circle, meaning that most research on membrane technology was carried out in mid-2018. Every year there are research developments to perfect previous research. Water treatment technology has drawbacks, so it was developed using the nanofiltration membrane method in 2018 (Figure 4b) until now. The development of nanofiltration membrane properties (morphology) and improve membrane performance such as water permeability, salt rejection, and hydrophilicity using graphene oxide, MOF and nanoparticles as fillers was carried out in 2019 (figures 4c and 4d). The application of

nanofiltration membranes that have been modified from year to year is increasingly widespread, starting from wastewater treatment until now it can be used in water desalination treatment. In the last 10 years the development of research that is often carried out on nanofiltration membranes is analyzed based on density visualization which explains the level of depth of research that has been carried out. Figure 5 shows that there are differences in color intensity in each region. The yellow color is an area of research development that is often carried out, such as membrane performance, graphene oxide, water treatment, and morphology.

# 3.3 Bibliometric analysis on journals highly cited papers

The literature obtained in this study involved 998 publications, Elsevier and ACS Publications published the most on the development of NF membranes, reaching 692 and 99 of the 998 publications obtained through the Publish or Perish software (Figure 6). 10 of them published no less than 5 articles, mainly involving water treatment, material application, and the environment, such as the Journal of Water Process Engineering, Applied Materials & Interfaced, and Environmental Science & Technology. this shows that this research area is very useful for present and future life, besides that it can also be used as a reference for research development.



Figure 4. Overlay visualization of nanofiltration membrane.

Figure 7 presents the top 10 journals in terms of number of articles published. The number of articles published in the 8th and 9th is the same. In this case the number of articles published in the top 10 journals gives 66.53% of the total number of articles published in this field, and the rest gives 33.47%. Among the number of articles published in the top three, the Journal of Membrane Science, Desalination and Separation and Purification Technology gives nearly three quarters. And the journal is most often cited which shows this journal is a core journal in this field. Table 2 shows the top 10 articles cited, which were published 10 years ago, while 3 of them are review articles. The three most cited articles are more than 1000 times, 1551 times, 1467 times and 1241 times respectively. The most cited article is the use of graphene oxide as a filler in nanofiltration membranes.



Figure 5. Density Visualization of Nanofiltration Membrane



Figure 6. Publisher Portal and Number of Publications

Year	Title of the article	Source	Author	Cited numbers
2015	Nanofiltration membranes review: Recent advances and future prospects	Desalination	AW Mohammad	1551
2013	Ultrathin graphene nanofiltration membrane for water purification	Advanced Functional Materials	Y Han	1467
2014	Molecular separation with organic solvent nanofiltration: a critical review	Chemical Reviews	P Marchetti	1241
2016	Large-area graphene-based nanofiltration membranes by shear alignment of discotic nematic liquid crystals of graphene oxide	Nature Communications	A Akbari	586
2013	Removal of heavy metal ions by nanofiltration	Desalination	BAM Al- Rashdi	557
2013	Effects of pH and salt on nanofiltration—a critical review	Journal of Membrane Science	J Luo	511

**Table 2.** Top 10 Papers with Cited Frequency



Figure 7. Top 10 Journals in The Number of Publisheed Articles

# 4. Conclusion

Based on bibliometric analysis, since the publication of the field of membrane technology in 2013, the total number of annual publications has experienced a period of ups, downs and then up again, and in recent years the topic of nanofiltration membranes has been in a period of rapid development, influenced by developments regarding modification of nanofiltration membranes with the addition of fillers. to improve the morphological structure of the membrane and the performance of the membrane. a large number of researchers have developed this field in various water treatment applications such as wastewater treatment, salt rejection to water desalination and achieved rapid development.

## **5. References**

- Al Husaeni DF & Nandiyanto ABD. 2021. Bibliometric using vosviewer with publish or perish (using google scholar data): From step-by-step processing for users to the practical examples in the analysis of digital learning articles in pre and post covid-19 Pandemic. *ASEAN Journal of Science and Engineering*, 2(1), 19–46. <u>https://doi.org/10.17509/ajse.v2i1.37368</u>
- Azizah NN, Maryanti R, & Nandiyanto ABD. 2021. How to search and manage references with a specific referencing style using google scholar: From step-by-step processing for users to the practical examples in the referencing education. *Indonesian Journal of Multidiciplinary Research*, 1(2), 267–294. https://doi.org/10.17509/ijomr.v1i2.37694
- Bagheripour E, Moghadassi AR, Parvizian F, Hosseini SM, & Van der Bruggen B. 2019. Tailoring the separation performance and fouling reduction of PES based nanofiltration membrane by using a PVA/Fe3O4 coating layer. *Chemical Engineering Research and Design*, 144, 418–428.

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cherd.2019.02.028

- Behdarvand F, Valamohammadi E, Tofighy MA, & Mohammadi T. 2021a. Polyvinyl alcohol/polyethersulfone thin-film nanocomposite membranes with carbon nanomaterials incorporated in substrate for water treatment. *Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering*, 9(1), 104650. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jece.2020.104650</u>
- Bet-Moushoul E, Mansourpanah Y, Farhadi K, & Tabatabaei M. 2016. TiO2 nanocomposite based polymeric membranes: A review on performance improvement for various applications in chemical engineering processes. *Chemical Engineering Journal*, 283, 29–46. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cej.2015.06.124
- Ding M, & Zeng H. 2022. A bibliometric analysis of research progress in sulfate-rich wastewater pollution control technology. *Ecotoxicology and Environmental Safety*, 238, 113626. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecoenv.2022.113626
- Ihsanullah. 2019. Carbon nanotube membranes for water purification: Developments, challenges, and prospects for the future. *Separation and Purification Technology*, 209, 307–337. <u>https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.seppur.2018.07.043</u>
- Karimi A, Khataee A, Vatanpour V, & Safarpour M. 2019. High-flux PVDF mixed matrix membranes embedded with size-controlled ZIF-8 nanoparticles. *Separation and Purification Technology*, 229(July), 115838. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.seppur.2019.115838</u>
- Kusworo TD, Kumoro AC, Utomo DP, Kusumah FM, & Pratiwi MD. 2021. Performance of the Crosslinked PVA Coated PES-TiO2Nano Hybrid Membrane for the Treatment of Pretreated Natural Rubber Wastewater Involving Sequential Adsorption - Ozonation Processes. *Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering*, 9(2), 104855. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jece.2020.104855</u>
- Mao G, Hu H, Liu X, Crittenden J, & Huang N. 2021. A bibliometric analysis of industrial wastewater treatments from 1998 to 2019. *Environmental Pollution*, 275, 115785. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envpol.2020.115785</u>
- Park HM, Oh H, Jee KY, & Lee YT. 2020. Synthesis of PVDF/MWCNT nanocomplex microfiltration membrane via atom transfer radical addition (ATRA) with enhanced fouling performance. *Separation and Purification Technology*, 246, 116860. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.seppur.2020.116860</u>
- Plaza-Garrido A, Limaico M, & Villamar-Ayala CA. 2022. Influence of wastewater treatment technologies on virus removal under a bibliometric-statistical analysis. *Journal of Water Process Engineering*, 47, 102642. <u>https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jwpe.2022.102642</u>
- Thakur VK, & Voicu SI. 2016. Recent advances in cellulose and chitosan based membranes for water purification: A concise review. *Carbohydrate Polymers*, 146, 148–165. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.carbpol.2016.03.030</u>
- Wang W, Zhu L, Shan B, Xie C, Liu C, Cui F, & Li G. 2018. Preparation and characterization of SLS-CNT / PES ultra fi ltration membrane with antifouling and antibacterial properties. *Journal of Membrane Science*, *548*, 459–469. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.memsci.2017.11.046</u>
- Yuan H, Wang Y, Cheng L, Liu W, Ren J, & Meng L. 2014. Improved antifouling property of poly(ether sulfone) ultrafiltration membrane through blending with poly(vinyl alcohol). *Industrial and Engineering Chemistry Research*, 53(48), 18549–18557. https://doi.org/10.1021/ie502797k